



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Antoinette Abdul-
Hakeem, Keyboarding Clerk 2
(PM3723D), East Orange

CSC Docket No. 2022-2853

Examination Appeal

ISSUED: AUGUST 3, 2022 (RE)

Antoinette Abdul-Hakeem appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Keyboarding Clerk 2 (PM3723D), East Orange.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of February 22, 2022. The examination was open to employees in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the title Keyboarding Clerk 1 or Keyboarding Clerk 1, Bilingual in Spanish and English and who met the announced requirement of one year of clerical experience operating an alphanumeric keyboard or typewriter to produce documents such as letters, memos, reports, charts, forms and other materials. Successful completion of a clerical training program with a minimum of 700 clerical training hours or 30 semester hour credits in secretarial science from an accredited college or university could be substituted for the experience requirement. The appellant was determined to be ineligible for below minimum requirements in experience. As there were no admitted candidates, the examination was cancelled on May 20, 2022.

On her application, the appellant listed one position, Switchboard Operator from September 2009 to November 2011. She did not provide a resume with her application. Official records indicate an additional employment history. These records indicate that the appellant was a provisional Keyboarding Clerk 2 from July 2021 to the February 2022 closing date; and a Keyboarding Clerk 1 from October 2011 to July 2021. As the appellant did not indicate any production of documents

for the duties of the one position listed on her application, she was found to be lacking one year of applicable experience.

On appeal, the appellant states that she has been working in the Division for ten years, that her ineligibility is unjustified and inequitable, and she deserves a promotion. She states that she was a Switchboard Operator, a Clerk, and has a Bachelor's degree in Psychology. She provides a resume which includes these positions. For her "Clerk" position, the appellant indicates that she resolves questions, inconsistencies and missing data; assists with locating records and retrieving data base information; prepares documents for scanning by removing staples and sorting them; stages documents for destruction; safeguards data accessibility by file management and organization; verifies data accuracy; maintains accuracy while entering data into designated fields; identifies and corrects data entry errors; and assists customers with applications.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date.

In the instant matter, the appellant was denied eligibility as she did not produce documents while in her position as Switchboard Operator, the one position she listed as her experience. On appeal, the appellant indicates that she has worked for the appointing authority for ten years as a "Clerk." Official records indicate that she was in the titles Keyboarding Clerk 1 and Keyboarding Clerk 2. Nonetheless, a review of the duties she listed for her provisional position do not indicate that she produces documents such as letters, memos, reports, charts, forms and other materials. Rather, the focus of her position is data entry. As such, if the appointing authority wants the appellant to remain in her current position, the appellant should provide a duties questionnaire (enclosed) to Agency Services detailing the duties of the position, along with a completed examination application within 30 days of the issuance of this decision, so that an appropriate provisional title can be assigned, and a pre-qualification determination can be made. Should the appellant be found not eligible for the new provisional appointment, she should be returned to her underlying permanent title at that time. In the future, if Agency Services determines that the position is that of Keyboarding Clerk 2, a new examination can be announced.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support her burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied, and the matter of the classification of the appellant's provisional position be referred to the Division of Agency Services for review.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 3RD DAY OF AUGUST 2022



Deirdre L. Webster Cobb
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Nicholas F. Angiulo
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P. O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

c: Antoinette Abdul-Hakeem
Solomon Steplight
Division of Agency Services
Records Center

<h2 style="margin: 0;">POSITION CLASSIFICATION QUESTIONNAIRE</h2> <p style="margin: 0;">NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION DIVISION OF STATE & LOCAL OPERATIONS</p>	FOR CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION USE
--	----------------------------------

<p>IMPORTANT: Full instructions for completing this form are located on the last page. It is most important that employees and supervisors read them carefully. The form must be signed by the employee, his or her supervisor, the Program Manager or Division Director and the Appointing Authority Representative.</p> <p>INCOMPLETE REQUESTS WILL BE RETURNED.</p>	S&LO LOG NO. EMPLOYEE ID # CSS REQUEST NO.
--	--

1. NAME OF EMPLOYEE (IF ANY)	2. ANNUAL SALARY (<i>Current</i>)	3. POSITION NO.	4. CODE (<i>Range and Title</i>)
------------------------------	-------------------------------------	-----------------	------------------------------------

5. OFFICIAL TITLE OF POSITION	6. WORKING TITLE (<i>If different</i>)
-------------------------------	--

7. LOCATION OF POSITION
(Geographic location, Unit, Section, Division, Institution, or Department)

7A. EMPLOYEE WORK OR HOME MAILING ADDRESS

8. WORK (DUTIES) PERFORMED - Describe in detail the work required of this position. Make descriptions so clear that persons unfamiliar with the work can understand exactly what is done. **NOTE:** If this is a vacant position or a new position request, the form must be completed by the supervisor of the position and certified for accuracy by the Appointing Authority Representative.

Percent of Time	Work (Duties) Performed	Order of Difficulty

ITEM 8 CONTINUED

Percent of Time	Work (Duties) Performed	Order of Difficulty

9. REGULAR SCHEDULE OF WORK HOURS

DAY	FROM	TO	DAY	FROM	TO
Monday			Friday		
Tuesday			Saturday		
Wednesday			Sunday		
Thursday			Length of Lunch Period _ _ _ _		
Total Hours Worked Per Week _ _ _ _ _					

9b. EXPLAIN ROTATION OF SHIFTS, IF ANY



QUESTIONNAIRE CONTINUED

10. TYPE OF SUPERVISION RECEIVED (Check One — See definitions on page 4)

- CLOSE
 LIMITED
 GENERAL
 OTHER (Explain) _____

11. Does this position supervise other employees?

- YES (If yes, complete Items A thru E) NO
 A. Occasionally? [or] Regularly?
 B. Responsible for the preparation of performance evaluations? YES NO
 C. Assign work? YES NO
 D. Review completed work of employees supervised? YES NO

E. List the names and titles of the employees supervised directly.

(If the employees supervised comprise one or more complete units, include the names of the units)

12. CERTIFICATION OF EMPLOYEE



I CERTIFY that I have read the instructions and the entries made above are my own and, to the best of my knowledge, are accurate and complete.

SIGNATURE _____ DATE _____

13. STATEMENTS OF IMMEDIATE SUPERVISOR

A. Comments on Statements of Employee

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

B. What do you consider the most important duties of this position?

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

C. List those knowledges and abilities necessary for standard performance of the job to be done by an incumbent of this position

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

D. I AGREE DISAGREE with the employee's description of job duties, percentage of time, and order of difficulty.

COMMENTS:

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

OFFICIAL TITLE
(Working title if different)

SIGNATURE

DATE

14. STATEMENTS OF PROGRAM MANAGER OR DIVISION DIRECTOR

- I AGREE with the statements of the immediate supervisor.
- I DISAGREE with the statements of the immediate supervisor.

COMMENTS:

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

OFFICIAL TITLE <i>(Working title if different)</i>	SIGNATURE	DATE
---	-----------	------

15A. STATE APPOINTING AUTHORITY REPRESENTATIVE SIGNATURE

In State service, the agency representative's signature certifies the information in accordance with 4A:3-3.9(c)1.

OFFICIAL TITLE <i>(Working title if different)</i>	SIGNATURE	DATE
---	-----------	------

15B. LOCAL APPOINTING AUTHORITY REPRESENTATIVE SIGNATURE

In Local service, the agency representative's signature certifies the information in accordance with 4A:3-3.9(d).

- I AGREE with the statements of the immediate supervisor and program manager or division director.
- I DISAGREE with the statements of the immediate supervisor and program manager or division director.

COMMENTS:

Check here if continued on additional sheets.

OFFICIAL TITLE <i>(Working title if different)</i>	SIGNATURE	DATE
---	-----------	------